

Summary, Conclusions, and Recommendations

Key Questions

Some of the key issues that have emerged from the foregoing analysis are given below.

- How can tourists be encouraged to venture deeper into Kalam and Hunza, to enjoy pristine natural assets, and to avoid saturating the resorts in Kalam and the reception areas in Hunza?
- Should the existing resort settlement in Kalam and the reception areas in Hunza remain tourist destinations in themselves, or become mainly staging areas for further excursions?
- How can more organised tourism be encouraged in Kalam in order to reduce coming overloads in resorts?
- How can more organised trekking be encouraged in Hunza in order to reduce the coming overload on the nearby trails?
- In Kalam, more local ownership and management of tourism facilities would enhance retained income and increase local jobs and markets for local products, further ensuring that tourists remain welcome. To what extent can local ownership and management be promoted, in consistence with other objectives for fairly rapid sustainable development? and how?
- In Hunza, most of the tourism service industry is owned by locals, who neither sell land nor allow outsiders to build hotels or restaurants. While continued local ownership and management are highly desirable, how can facilities and organisation be upgraded to meet the increased tourist loads?
- In Hunza, there are secondary schools for boys and girls, and English is taught at the primary level. Education is highly desirable, but the local language of Hunza is vanishing, as it does not have a written form. How can local culture be preserved in the face of rising tourism?

Main Recommendations

Developing Interior Assets

Kalam. Some prime tourism assets in the interior of Kalam, such as Mahodhand, Andrap, and Kundlao Dhand, are well-kept secrets, known only to a few anglers.

- Develop and launch a communication strategy to promote prime tourism assets in the interior of Kalam.
- Evolve and implement a development plan for interior tourism assets, based on government investment in trunk infrastructure, community management of common property, and private investment in profit-oriented activities.

Hunza. Some prime tourism assets in the interior of Hunza, such as Borli Lake, are well-kept secrets, known only to a few trekkers.

- Develop and launch a communication strategy to promote prime tourism assets in the interior of Hunza.
- Evolve and implement a development plan for interior tourism assets, based on government investment in trunk infrastructure, community management of common property, and private investment in profit-oriented activities.

Avoiding Risks of Saturation in Resorts

The resort settlements are located near scarce arable land. Losing precious cultivated land to infrastructure to meet the occasional peak demands of seasonal and fluctuating tourism is not a wise option.

- Develop village land-use plans for land-use control, in the existing resort settlements. through an exercise in which the whole village community participates.
- Develop and implement plans to build new resort settlements, or extensions of existing ones, away from Class I and II arable soils, catering to the full range of income groups among the tourists.

Encouraging Organised Group Tourism in Kalam

Carrying capacities for group rural recreation are considerably higher at every level of infrastructure provision than for individual rural recreation.

- Develop a system of economic incentives, uniformly operated by the tourism service industry, to promote group tourism.

Encouraging Litter Management Campaigns in Hunza

Carrying capacities for trekking are considerably higher at every level of infrastructure provision if trekking debris can be managed.

- Develop a system of rules and penalties, uniformly operated by the tourism service industry, to prevent littering and promote waste collection and proper disposal by group and individual trekkers.

Promoting Local Ownership and Management in Kalam

Local ownership and management can result in better management of facilities and environmental assets, because of residents' long-term interest in maintaining assets, compared to non-resident tourism operators. In Hunza, a local tourism industry has developed, whereas in Kalam locals lease out land for facilities owned and managed by outsiders. The key differences probably relate to credit and management training in tourist facilities.

- Develop and implement a preferential credit access plan for Kalamis, especially for interior assets.
- Provide Kalamis with preferential access to courses at the Hotel Management Training Institute.

Upgrading Local Ownership and Management in Hunza

Local ownership and management can result in better management of facilities and environmental assets, because of residents' long-term interest in maintaining assets, compared to transient, non-local tourism operators. In Hunza, a local tourism industry has developed but can be further promoted.

- Develop and implement a preferential credit access plan for Hunzakuts in the tourism trade, especially for remote assets in the interior of Hunza.
- Provide Hunzakuts with preferential access to courses at the Hotel Management Training Institute.

Preserving Local Cultural Heritage in Hunza

Local language and its dialects are in danger of being swamped by English and Urdu.

- Develop and implement a plan with anthropologists, folk heritage experts, and others for regular cultural folk shows and exhibitions for tourists, linking economic rewards with cultural preservation.

A Sustainable Development Strategy

A sustainable development strategy for mountain tourism should have at least four aspects.

- Planning: knowledge acquisition, consensus generation, and decision-making
- Institutional and organisational development
- Controls: legislative, regulatory, and economic
- Promotion: information, communication, and education

Planning

"Planning", says John Yost in his Tourism Development Strategy Project for NWFP, "is the single most important need for tourism development in the NWFP. An environmentally and culturally sensitive master plan is urgently needed for areas under pressure from tourism."

Tourism planning should be participated in by, and for, the local communities which have traditional rights to common property over much of northern Pakistan. Only such participatory planning has much chance of implementation.

Village communities can be taught the techniques of tourism planning. A topical Participatory Rural Appraisal (PRA) of tourism has recently been carried out by the KIDP with the people of Kalam *Bazaar*. Participatory Rural Appraisal is also a common technique of the Agha Khan Rural Support Programme, which encourages self-reliant planning and implementation. Such exercises should be replicated throughout northern Pakistan.

Institutional and Organisational Development

The topical PRA of tourism should promote new and strengthen existing village organisations for tourism management.

A main element of the strategy should be reorienting federal and provincial agencies to become more open to the priorities of local communities.

Intermediary NGOs may have a critical role to play in promoting such reorientation among government agencies responsible for tourism.

Controls to Avoid Risks of Saturation

Control methods fall into two conceptual categories: regulation of volumes by rules and by prices.

Regulation by rules has the following broad elements:

- permits,
- queuing,
- space allocation to activities, and
- time rationing.

In the USA, for example, trekkers have to obtain permits from the Bureau of Land Management in advance; last-minute trekkers have to wait in a queue for permits; the controlling authority gives licenses for fishing and allocates areas for various types of activities (speed boats versus canoes and kayaks); and it may alternatively allocate days of the week for certain types of activities on a trek or stretch of river.

Regulation by prices has the following broad elements:

- pricing,
- differential pricing,
- taxes, especially to cover externalities, and
- penalties.

Access to a surprising number of public goods is not priced, which is why they are over-used and abused. In a society with large differentials in income, it is justifiable to charge more to higher income groups for access to public environmental goods. Income groups are frequently easy to identify on the basis of the transport used by them. Taxes are needed that externalise impact by users. However, to be fully effective in promoting repair and maintenance of tourism assets, more taxes need to be collected and returned to the communities bearing the costs in a direct and transparent manner. Penalties

can control littering and are frequently more acceptable than jail sentences for minor damage to environmental assets commonly used by tourists and local communities.

Promotion

Tourism in the north is still Pakistan's best-kept secret, despite looming saturation in selected localities. In fact, risks of saturation in a few well-known resorts can be avoided by promoting more distant localities currently ignored or underutilised.

Among the prime instruments are:

- widespread Information dissemination,
- specific communication campaigns,
- incorporation in education co-curricula,
- direct subsidies to promote investment, and
- indirect subsidies (import duty concessions, etc).