



# Evaluation of Education Programme for girls in nomadic areas of Gao, Mali

Full Report

Oxfam GB Programme Evaluation

June 2007

Commissioned by: Oxfam GB West Africa

Evaluators: Aly Teyeni Mana

## **SYNOPSIS**

---

### **Acronyms**

### **SUMMARY**

#### **A – GENERAL IDEAS**

1. Introduction
2. Context of the mission
3. Objectives
4. Methodology used
5. Tools used
6. Organisation and course of the mission
7. Constraints and difficulties encountered

#### **B – DESCRIPTION AND ANALYSIS OF THE PROGRAMM**

##### **B1. DESCRIPTION OF THE PROGRAMM**

1. Context of implementation of the programme
2. Objectives of the programme
3. Strategies and activities
4. Actors et zones of intervention
5. Extend of the taking into account of the educational policies and trends
6. Influence of education by the national strategies

##### **B2. RESULTS**

1. Improvement of schooling
2. The rates of the education quality
3. Capacity building
  - 3.1. At the level of teachers and state services
  - 3.2. At the level of support and school management structures
  - 3.2. At the level of the Society
4. Impact of the programme on the behaviour changes and the practice of the populations
5. Comparative analysis of the objectives and results obtained
6. Average cost of the taking in charge of one student in the programme zone

#### **C - ANALYSIS OF THE PROGRAMME APPROACH**

#### **D – ACQUISITIONS AND LESSONS FROM THE PROGRAMME**

#### **E – STRENGTHS AND WEAKNESSES OF THE PROGRAMME**

#### **F - PROPOSALS OF NEW STRATEGIC ORIENTATIONS**

#### **G - RECOMMENDATIONS**

---

**H – HYPOTHESES AND RISKS**

**CONCLUSIONS**

---

**APPENDICES**

## Acronymes

---

<b>Académie</b>	: Académie de l'Enseignement ( <i>Education Authority</i> )
<b>AE</b>	: Académie de l'Enseignement ( <i>Education Authority</i> )
<b>ADESAH</b>	: Association pour le Développement Endogène au Sahel ( <i>Association for an Endogenous Development in the Sahel</i> )
<b>AME</b>	: Association des Mères d'Elèves ( <i>Association of Mothers of Pupils</i> )
<b>ANICT</b>	: Agence Nationale d'Investissement des Collectivités Territoriales ( <i>National Agency for Investment of Local Governments</i> )
<b>APE</b>	: Association des Parents d'Elèves ( <i>Association of Parents of Pupils</i> )
<b>CAP</b>	: Centre d'Animation Pédagogique ( <i>Centre for Pedagogical Animation</i> )
<b>CFEPCEF</b>	: Certificat de Fin d'Etudes du Premier Cycle de l'Enseignement Fondamental ( <i>End of First Cycle of Basic Education Certificate</i> )
<b>CDMT</b>	: Cadre de Dépenses à Moyen Terme ( <i>Framework of Mid Term Expenses</i> )
<b>CCE</b>	: Cadre de Concertation de l'Education ( <i>Framework for Consultation on Education</i> )
<b>CGS</b>	: Comité de Gestion Scolaire ( <i>School Management Committee</i> )
<b>CSLP</b>	: Cadre Stratégique de Lutte contre la Pauvreté ( <i>Strategic Framework of Fight Against Poverty</i> )
<b>CD</b>	: Collectivités Décentralisées ( <i>Decentralized Communities</i> )
<b>Ecoms</b>	: Ecole Communautaire ( <i>Community Schools</i> )
<b>EFA</b>	: Education For All
<b>EQPT</b>	: Education de Qualité Pour Tous ( <i>Quality Education For All</i> )
<b>Food Sec</b>	: Food Security
<b>GARI</b>	: Groupement des Artisans Ruraux de Intadeyni ( <i>Grouping of Intadeyni Rural Craftsmen</i> )
<b>HCNLS</b>	: Haut Conseil National de Lutte Contre le Sida ( <i>National High Counsel of Fight Against Aids</i> )
<b>IFM</b>	: Institut de Formation des Maîtres ( <i>Teacher Training Institute</i> )
<b>MEN</b>	: Ministère de l'Education Nationale ( <i>Ministry of National Education</i> )
<b>OGB</b>	: Oxfam Grande Bretagne ( <i>Oxfam Great Britain</i> )
<b>OSC</b>	: Organisations de la Société Civile ( <i>Organizations of the Civil Society</i> )
<b>WFP</b>	: World Food Programme
<b>Partners</b>	: The education programme partner NGOs
<b>SAP</b>	: Structural Adjustment Programme
<b>PASEC</b>	: Programme d'Analyse du Système Educatif ( <i>Analysis Programme of the Education System</i> )
<b>PASED</b>	: Programme d'Appui au Système Educatif Décentralisé ( <i>Support Programme to the Decentralized Education System</i> )
<b>PDCOM</b>	: Programme de Développement Communautaire ( <i>Community Development Programme</i> )
<b>PFIE</b>	: Programme de Formation Intégrée en Environnement ( <i>Integrated Training Programme in Environment</i> )
<b>PISE</b>	: Programme d'Investissement Sectoriel de l'Education ( <i>Sector Investment Programme in Education</i> )
<b>PRODEC</b>	: Programme Décennal de l'Education ( <i>Decennial Education Programme</i> )
<b>PTF</b>	: Partenaires Technique et Financiers ( <i>Financial and Technical Partners</i> )
<b>Scofi</b>	: Scolarisation des filles ( <i>Girls Schooling</i> )
<b>SDE</b>	: Services Déconcentrés de l'Etat ( <i>Deconcentrated State Services</i> )
<b>SMA</b>	: Semaine Mondiale d'Action ( <i>World Week of Action</i> )
<b>TASSAGHT</b>	: Lien en tamasheq ( <i>Link in Tamasheq</i> )

---

## SUMMARY

The Program Education of the girls in nomadic area in the region of Gao in Mali is an integral part of the Regional Program of Education in nomadic area. This Program covers Burkina Faso, Niger, Liberia, Ghana and Mali. The Program started in Mali in May 2001 and covers 18 schools in 3 circles (Bourem, Gao and Ménaka). The major objective is the improvement of the schooling of girls in the region of Gao. Based on the three major components of Prodec, (Access, Quality and Equity), the program was implemented with the participation of the communities through 3 local NGOs. It yielded very significant results in terms of:

1. Improvement of the rates of schooling with:

- \* an increase in the rate of enrolment of 50,75% including 51,58 in the girls
- \* an average rate of retention of 71% with 67,7% in the girls
- \* a success rate of approximately 38,5%

2. Reinforcement of expertise of the organizations of support to school management, in particular women with an appreciable increase in the number and the level of elimination of illiteracy (1042 women taught reading and writing out of a total of 1077 registered, that is 96,75%).

3. Capacity building of the women in dealing with the schooling of their daughters thanks to the technical and financial support of income generating activities (AGR).

4. Capacity building of the organizations of the Civil Society to carry out an effective advocacy through the creation of an inter-regional coalition of the north for Education For All, gathering the organizations of the civil society intervening in the field of education at the level of the three regions of North-Mali which are Kidal, Timbuktu and Gao.

Moreover, one of the major results of the program is the awakening of the various actors as for the schooling of the children and the management of the school.

However, these results which are still insufficient remain precarious and it is advisable to consolidate them. Indeed, the emulsion generated by the actions of the program involved an unquestionable passion of the populations for the school as long as the taking in charge done by OGB and other PTF (WFP, World Education, etc).

In addition, the program also knew weaknesses and constraints at the time of its implementation which strongly limited the reach of its objectives. The main weaknesses noticed are:

- the absence of a logical framework,
- the absence of a system of follow-up-evaluation of the activities
- the absence of a strategy of perennisation of the activities and the assets
- the absence of a synergy between the interventions of the various actors

One of the constraints of the program is the non mastery of the texts governing the management of the school in a decentralized mode by the OSC implied in the advocacy as well as by the grassroots communities.

In addition, the devolution of the goods and the transfer of the competences promised by decentralization to the local governments are long to come, putting those vis-à-vis responsibilities for which they are insufficiently prepared.

The impact of the program on the populations is not yet an asset because their level of organization is insufficient and their resources do not make it possible to face the very enormous loads of operation of the school, in zones marked by a hostile nature and an incompatibility between the traditional school (fixed) and their nomadic way of life.

On another different plan, the various dialogue frameworks envisaged by Prodec in PISE have problems of operation for reasons of insufficiency of resources at the level of qualified services for this purpose.

All things considered, the consolidation of the assets and the improvement of education in the zone of the Program necessarily pass by:

- the reinforcement of the activities of information, training and sensitizing of the actors on the mechanisms of financing and management of the school;
- the capacity building of the civil society to carry out an effective advocacy;
- the capacity building of intervention of the communities in taking in charge the costs of operation of the school;
- the capacity building of the teachers and the capacities of the decentralized state technical services;
- an interaction between the various actors of the program.

Also, a new phase of the program will have to be directed strategically towards the 4 basic axes which are:

- the advocacy
  - the support to the schools and the grassroots communities
  - the support to the decentralized state technical services.
  - the setting in synergy of the interventions of the various actors for a better management of the partnership by the installation of frameworks of intervention and dialogue between the actors of the program.
-

## A- GENERAL IDEAS

### 1. Introduction

In 2002, the proportion of the poor population in Mali accounted for 67%. By adopting the final document of the 1st stage of the Strategic Framework of Fight Against Poverty (CSLP), the authorities had fixed the threshold to be reached in 2006 to 47%, that is to say a retreat of 20% in 4 years. This fight against poverty passes on the one hand, by the increase in the access of the poor to the basic social services, in particular education, and, on the other hand, the improvement of the quality and the relevance of teaching and the trainings. Also, Education is it in the heart of this strategy.

The decennial Programme of development of education (PRODEC) was thus conceived as an instrument forming an integral part of the strategy of development of the country.

In spite of the provided efforts (30% of the national budget are devoted to Education), the evaluations of the 1st stage (PISE I) of the PRODEC still indicate major insufficiencies as for the reach of the objectives of EFA. Indeed, according to the Cell of Planning and Statistics (CPS) of the Ministry for National Education (MEN), the rates of schooling are of: 67,6% in 2004-2005 with regard to the access in 1st year of the basic school; 43,1% for the rate of completion to the primary education and the rate of repeating still accounted for 18,6% in 2005.

These rates undergo deep variations according to the regions, urban or rural area, or the level of income of households or the gender.

In addition, the level of retention of the reading ability at the adulthood of the pupils having reached class 6 in Mali is very low, placing the country among the least performing countries. This situation would be explained, partly at least by the low level of the trainings in the Malian school.

In addition, the political and institutional context of advanced decentralization, gives a basic right of view to the local authorities in the management of the school matters. Indeed, decentralization requires:

- a deconcentration of the educational activities,
- the decentralized management of education through the transfer of the resources allowing the local authorities to exert in full responsibility the competences which are reserved for them by the law and which are:

-

Competence 1: Recruitment and taking in charge the wages of the teachers

Competence 2: Organization taking in charge the examinations

Competence 3: Management and followed school building

Competence 4: Maintenance of the school buildings

Competence 5: Management of the water points

Competence 6: Management of school furniture

Competence 7: Development and implementation of the school map

Competence 8: Supply and management of the didactic material

Competence 9: Supply and management of the school stationery

- recognition and the enforcement of the complementarities of the roles of the various partners defined at the time of the National Forum on the School held on February 18 and 19 2003 in Bamako.

This forum devoted the creation of the School Management Committee whose Organization and Procedure were fixed by the Decree n°0469/MEN-SG dated March 9 2004. Today, according to figures advanced by Fast Track Initiative (FTI), 57% of the public financial resources of education were transferred to the local authorities making thus effective the recruitment of contractual teachers by the said authorities. However, one has to recognize that the challenges of the school remain still enormous regarding the level of the resources allocated by the Treasury.

Indeed, commitments regarding EFA are the first responsibility of the Government both from the point of view of the choices of the educational policies and of the very financing of the sector. However, the importance of the resources to be mobilized exceeds by far the possibilities offered by the national budget. Also, it remains that the success of the implementation of the new educational policy of Mali calls for *a reinforcement of the partnership and the setting in synergy* of all the potentialities for the reach of the objectives of the EFA.

Decentralization, started for nearly two decades by the Malian authorities, had a major consequence at the level of the school; this was an exponential explosion of the number of schools. Thus, in the region of Gao, the number of schools (public and private) was estimated at 135 at the beginning of the school year 2000-2001. At the school resuming of October 2006, there were 318 schools including 266 with the first cycle, that is to say an increase of 200% (report of new school year 2006-2007 of the Education Authority of Gao.

On another different plan Mali knew at the beginning of the Nineties a rebellion which deeply marked the process of development in the three north regions of the country which are the regions of Gao, Timbuktu and Kidal. This crisis, indeed, involved the displacement of the populations either towards other regions of the country, or towards other countries. Moreover, the populations lost a significant part of their livestock as well as their means of subsistence with in addition, a residual insecurity. At the level of some households, there are orphan children and often, of the both parents.

## **2. Context of the mission**

The mission, object of this report, intervened in a context singularly marked by:

- the end of the partnership between the program and the partner NGOs,
- the end of the school year marked by the organization of the examinations,
- the departure and the arrival of some agents within the programs and the Administration
- the beginning of the fiscal year of OGB with its procession of programming

## **3. Objectives of the mission**

The purpose of the mission of which this report is the result is to evaluate the degree of reach of the objectives of the education program of OGB. In a specific way, they were:

**Objective 1** To analyze the strategies of support to the components, access, quality and gender

**Concerning the access:** to analyze the relevance of the support to the schools for the period covered by the program through partners of the civil society, as well as the impact of the action at the levels of the villages and its repercussion at the national level,

**Concerning quality:** to analyze the relevance of the support of the official structures of education to the schools of the program in Mali and the accompaniment of partner NGOs through their Education coordinators and their animatrices in terms of in service training of teachers, and the impact on the trainings.

**Concerning the gender:** to analyze the strategies used to come to the parity girls/boys and to analyze the changes of mentality at the level of the families and the teachers in particular concerning the distribution of the activities at school and concerning the sexual division of work

To analyze the criteria of success of the component elimination of illiteracy, in particular in term of acquired competences and capacity of the recipients to use these competences.

Concerning capacity building:

- ✓ To analyze the strategy of capacity building and the effectiveness of the transfer of national competences to partner NGOs and the impact on the perpetuation of the assets of the program.
- ✓ To analyze the quality of the advocacy and the results reached as for the changes of policies and practices both at the national and local level
- ✓ To analyze the process of installation of the inter regional coalition of the North for EFA (which assets? Which strengths/weaknesses and which recommendations for the perpetuation of the structure?)
- ✓ To analyze the impact of the income generating activities as a strategy of perpetuation and autonomisation of the actors of the program.

**Objective 2:** For each axis which adjustments and reorientations to be brought in terms of practices and policies.

**Objective 3:** Is the program a set of projects or does it integrate a whole programme approach? To make recommendations in terms of reorientation and diversification of the strategy of the programme (concerning the axes, but also concerning the geographical aspect).

**Objective 4:** To analyze the degree of taking into account of the policies and educational tendencies and which will be the relevant activities for the years to come in connection with the work of Oxfam GB, the objectives and results of the PRODEC. Which innovations to be brought?

**Objective 5:** To analyze the contribution of the program to the emergence of a civil society as a force of influence and proposal in education and with the change of the policies and practices and to make recommendations on the role of this one in the follow-up of the educational policies, EFA, of the advocacy for the right to education in the context of the international assistance.

**Objective 6:** To analyze the way in which current national strategies, such as the Strategic Framework of Fight Against Poverty, the sectorial policies and the process of decentralization could influence the support to the education of the civil society and the local actors concerning:

- ✓ The provision of the services
- ✓ The role of the civil society in the process of decentralization

- ✓ How to ensure the connections and possible partnership between the support to the process of decentralization and other reforms of the education system on one hand and programs of local development on the other hand, especially in the following fields: institutional capacity, local participation and governance, partnership between local and national actors, incorporation of the transverse subjects (gender, HIV/AIDS and environment) in the planning of local development of the sector of education.

**Objective 7:** To analyze the relevance of the intervention through national NGOs, their degree of appropriation of the program, their appreciation of the partnership and their capacities to manage a program.

**Objective 8:** To learn the useful lessons that could be used as examples of training for all the team of the education program and to contribute to the development of a new education program in the Sahel.

*See TOR in appendix n°1*

#### **4. Methodology used**

For the reach of these objectives of evaluation, we proceeded by the methodology hereafter:

- Analyze preliminary documentation on the program
- Organization of a workshop assessment with the providing NGOs in order to have an overall vision of the program
- Sampling: our sample consisted of 9 sites out of the 18.
- Identification of the indicators to be appreciated
- Development of the tools of collection and analysis of the data
- Administration of the guides: it was made either individually, or in a focus group

It should be noted that the phase of test of the guides did not take place for the simple reason that it would take more time in view of the agenda of the mission. So, this significant stage was coupled with the meetings with the first target groups.

- Analyze data
- Presentation of the preliminary results of the evaluation to the staff of OGB in Bamako
- Drafting of the evaluation report
- Restitution of the evaluation report

*See technical proposal in appendix n° 2*

#### **5. Tools used**

The tools used are of two kinds:

- The guides of talk for the data collection on the field and
- The grids of analysis for the determination and the appreciation of the various indicators identified.

As for the guides of talk, several half directing guides were elaborated at the for several actors at the various levels of intervention:

- At the level of OGB: Program Manager (PM or Director of the Programs), Program Officer (PO or Program Officer) and his Assistant, PO of the other programs (Food Safety, Water-Hygiene-Sanitation, Gender), Logistician.
- At the level of the beneficiary community: School Management Committees (CGS), Association of the Mothers of Pupils (AME), Coordination of the associations of women, communal elected officials, Directors of Pedagogic Animation Centres (CAP), Education advisers, Director of the Education Authority (AE), headmasters and teachers, pupils, host families,
- At the level of partner NGOs: officers for the education program

The grids of analysis were elaborated according to the indicators to be determined. Therefore, there are grids of analysis:

- Of the evolution of schooling
- Of the activities of micro credits
- Etc

*See list of documents consulted and tools of evaluation in appendix n°3.*

## **6. Organization and course of the mission**

Moving out of the phase of selection, we contacted the persons in charge for the education program at the sub-regional level in order to learn more about the provisions to take, the mission having to be held in Gao. After this talk we went to Gao for the signature of the contract and the starting of the mission.

*See chronogram of intervention in appendix n° 4*

Thus, all the conveniences of work were put together by the Person in charge of the Education Project (PO) and the PM in order to enable us to carry out our mission well.

It should be noted that all the team of OGB did their best to allow us to conclude the mission. This is the opportunity to say thank you all.

## **7. Constraints and difficulties encountered**

However, the realization of the mission knew some difficulties which are due to:

- The relatively short time of evaluation,
- The scattering of the required documents
- The period of the evaluation; this coincided with the end of the school year examinations as well as the end of the partnership between OGB and the NGOs
- The absence of some actors on the field and who we could not meet
- The variation of the data from one report to another and between the partners and OGB

- The absence of some data, which did not make it possible to sufficiently disaggregate the rates in order to appreciate the impact of the program on their evolution.

---

## **B – DESCRIPTION AND ANALYSIS OF THE PROGRAM**

### **B1. DESCRIPTION OF THE PROGRAM**

#### **1. Context of implementation of the program**

The administrative region of Gao has got 4 circles and 24 communes. In the Sector of Education, the region is managed by:

- One (1) Education Authority which is the decentralized technical service of regional level in charge of the design, the dissemination and the follow-up of the national policy as regards to education. The Education Authority coordinates the activities of the various partners and sees at the respect of the texts in force.
- Four (4) Centres of Pedagogic Animation at the level of each circle. They are the dismemberments of the Education Authority and constitute the most decentralized services of the Ministry of Education

In addition to these decentralized State technical services, the operators in the sector of Education at the level of the region of Gao are:

- **World Education** which carries out a program of the Ministry of National Education called " Program of Support to the Quality and the Equity of Education " on 3 communes of the CAP de Gao (Gounzourèye, Gabéro and Gao) in 50 schools out of which 41 public schools and 9 medersas with 3 basic components that are the In service training of teachers, the Syllabus and the Community Participation component. To these 3 components it is necessary to add the schooling of the girls by a material support, the dynamization and the training of the management structures, the information and the sensitizing of the Community and school actors on the HIV/AIDS and gender and the literacy of the communities;
- **WFP** whose support is centred on the school canteens with the food supply in the schools;
- **The PASED:** Program of Support to the Decentralized Education System. It intervenes in 10 schools distributed over the 4 CAP of the region with a special focus on management, the access and the installation of a literate environment through the elimination of illiteracy. It should be noted that this program is going towards its end which is scheduled for December 2007
- **OXFAM GB** which intervenes in 18 schools of 3 circles with the Education Program, object of this evaluation.

It should be noted that other interveners are announced but who do not have effective activities yet on the field. It is the case for example of the Assistance of the Norwegian Church (AEN).

The study on the problems of basic education in the region of Gao in Mali, realized on OGB financing in June 2001, reveals that at the same period, the gross rate of schooling in the region of Gao is 53,2% as a whole and 42,1% for the girls. As for the schooling of the boys, it reached 57,87%, that is to say a variation of 15,74%.

According to this study, the population of the region is characterized by the nomadic (21,1%), semi-nomadic (28,7%) and sedentary (50,3) ways of life. The movements of the nomadic populations are done in a distance of 50 km (only 3,2% of the nomadic population move beyond 50 km).

Another basic data is the age of the girl at first marriage. In the region, it is estimated at less than 13 years for 23,9% of the population. What is very significant as it is known that at this age, more than half of the children have not yet completed the First Cycle of basic Education.

In addition and always according to the same study, one notes that in the zone 47,4% of the households do not have 2 meals per day.

## **2. Objectives of the program**

The objectives of the program education at the level of Mali are stated as follows in the project document. These objectives were re-examined and corrected 10 times and the last version goes back to the year 2007.

### **General objectives**

- To increase the schooling of the girls and their retention at school in order to answer the commitments of Dakar in terms of equity between gender before 2009.
- The parents of the zones of interventions require more and more a good quality basic education for their children.
- Before 2009, at least 75% of the women framed by the program will be taught reading and writing and will have sufficient incomes to support the schooling of the girls.
- Before 2009, the parents and teachers will develop positive attitudes with respect to the schooling of the girls while discouraging the practices prejudicial to the rights and the welfare of the girls.
- To influence the implementation of the policies favourable to the improvement of the quality of education in Mali before 2009.

### **Specific objectives of the project**

- To increase at least by 70% the T.B.S (rough rate of schooling) in the zones of intervention from here 2009,
- To obtain at least a schooling rate of 75% of which 50% of girls until the second cycle before 2009.
- To influence the Malian government to respect the commitments of Dakar with regard to E.F.A.

**Photos n° 1**

**Photos n° 2**

**[Photos Removed]**

Some students we met during the mission: On the left some members of the students' Government of Taboye, and on the right the girls of the school of Dengha, on tables donated to the school by OGB.

### **3. Axes, strategies and activities**

#### **3.1. Axes of intervention**

The Education Program intervenes on the major axes which are:

The access and retention of the children at school

This axis proposes solutions and answers on the basis of an objective analysis of the current situation and aims in view while being based on the following points:

- The promotion of schooling, in particular that of the girls
- Support to the school canteens
- Support to the host families
- Equipment of the schools in equipment of pumping
- Sensitizing of the parents by the model animatrice
- Capacity building of the structures of management of schools (CGS, APE, AME)

The quality of education

The activities of the Program here are centred on the improvement of the effectiveness of education and the trainings.

The aims in view are based on the following points:

- The In service training of teachers
- The reduction of the percentage of repeating
- Equipment of the schools in school stationery and didactic material
- Capacity building of the structures of management of the schools
- Support to the AGR
- Elimination of illiteracy of the women

With regard to the quality of Education, according to "Fast Track Initiative" or "EFA accelerated financing", FTI, worked out in October 2006, " it arises from the results of the comparative studies carried out within the framework of the Analysis Program of the Education System (PASEC) that the average score of acquisition of the Malian pupils (.....) is close to that of the countries having the weakest score and is approximately **10 points below** what is observed on average in 9 West African French-speaking –countries ".

## The Equity/Gender

At the level of this axis, the program aims at the promotion of the balance between girls and boys at school through:

- the support to the enrolment of girls
- reinforcement of competences of the mothers of pupils by the elimination of illiteracy

## The Advocacy

This axis relates to the reinforcement of expertise and capacities for the civil society, the partner NGOs partners and decentralized technical services. The capacity building is on:

- training
- the support to the AGR (primarily in the circle of Bourem)
- the support to advocacy

### 3.2. Strategies of the program

The strategies of intervention of the program can be summarized as follows:

**Table n° 1:** Summary table of the strategic objectives of the program

Axes/Components	Strategies	Objectives (determinants to overcome)
<b>Access and retention</b>	The model animatrice approach	Overcome the reluctance of parents to send their daughters to school by showing to them at each opportunity of activity a girl from the village or whom school has a positive impact.
	Host family	Get the child close to school
	School canteens	Retain the child at school
	Pharmaceutical kits	Reduce the absenteeism rate of children relating to illnesses
<b>Quality</b>	In service training of teachers	Improve the quality of education
	Support to the implementation of the curriculum of basic education	
	Supplying didactic materials	
<b>Gender</b>	Literacy of women	Increase the competences of women in management
	Support to Women AGR	Increase the financial capacities of women
	Training of partner NGOs	Increase the competences of the NGOs

<b>Advocacy</b>	Training of the CGS, AME and women coordination, etc.	Improve the governance at the level of these Increase the competences of these structures for a better participation in the local development in general and the management of school in particular
	Restocking at the level of the CGS	Increase the capacities and ensure autonomy
	Support to the installation of the coalition	Increase the competence of the Civil Society to influence decision makers at a national and local level for making decisions favourable to the promotion of schooling in general and the schooling of girls in particular.

The choice to operate through model animatrices in the villages of intervention was of an unquestionable appropriateness. Indeed, due to the fact that they are from these villages, knowing the customs and habits, they represent a perfect target of models to be promoted. And the populations were very sensitive to this «success », especially the women. So, some (Taboye) readily, admitted they want to return to the school in order to be like " your animatrice ". «Today she (the animatrice) does not need a man to provide for her needs and she guides us in our steps at the level of the administration ".

**Photographs n° 3:** The Animatrice of the school of Tabangout I (Ménaka)

**[Photos Removed]**

The host families, the canteens as well as the school stationery allowed to solve the difficulties related to the distances, and the insufficiency of resources of the parents. These various strategies proved reliable and enabled the program to obtain the results which are analyzed below.

### 3.3. Activities

The activities undertaken by the program aim at removing the obstacles to schooling in the schools of the zone of intervention. According to the axes or components these activities are summarized as follows:

**Table n° 2:** Activities undertaken by axis or component

<b>Axes or Components</b>	<b>Activities</b>
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Training of the actors of school</li> <li>- Animation /Sensitizing in the schools,</li> <li>- Equipment of pupils in school materials,</li> <li>- Food for the pupils, (canteens),</li> <li>- First hand treatment of pupils (pharmaceutical kits),</li> </ul>

<b>Access and retention</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Equipment of host families with sheep and goats (activity integrated in Food Sec),</li> <li>- Installation of a support unit to the canteen (core for breeding - activity integrated Food Sec),</li> <li>- Supplying water and pumping material (activity integrated in WatSan),</li> <li>- Equipment of the schools with school furniture,</li> <li>- prizes for the best girls pupils</li> </ul>
<b>Quality</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- In service training of teachers,</li> <li>- support to the implementation of the curriculum</li> <li>- Supplying books to teachers,</li> </ul>
<b>Gender Equity</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Animation/Sensitizing of teachers and populations on gender equity at school,</li> <li>- Support to the enrolment and the retention of girls,</li> <li>- Literacy of women,</li> </ul>
<b>Capacity building and reinforcement of competences</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- In service training of teachers,</li> <li>- Training of the support organizations to school management</li> <li>- Support to women AGR (micro credit), to CGS (restocking)</li> <li>- Support to SC for advocacy,</li> <li>- Animation on HIV/AIDS</li> <li>- planning, projects designing, support to micro credit</li> </ul>
<b>Advocacy</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Support to SC for advocacy during the EFA weeks</li> <li>Support to the creation of the interregional coalition of the north for EFA</li> </ul>

Training sessions were carried out for several target groups and were on very varied topics such as:

- roles and responsibilities of the actors of School,
- the development of the action plans,
- the management of the canteens,
- the rights of the children and the legislation of marriage,
- HIV/AIDS,
- etc

It will be noticed that these training sessions, even if they suit to the concerns of the school, do not take into account the whole of the parameters for a better implication of the various actors. They are parameters such as the control of the texts governing the management of the school in decentralized mode by the OSC and the grassroots communities. Also, the mechanisms of financing of the decentralized school are not well mastered by the communities.

#### **4. Zones of intervention and actors**

##### **4.1. Zone of intervention**

The Education Program currently intervenes in 18 schools of the rural communes of 3 circles of the region of Gao.

*See sample and list of the schools framed at appendix n°5.*

The results of the basic study entitled «Problems of basic education in the region of Gao, June 2001" reveals that the zone of intervention of the program is characterized at the same time by a weak rate of schooling of the children (53,2% of which 42,1de girls) and their parents (73,1% of the parents interviewed affirmed not to have any educational level). As surprising as that can appear, the level of illiteracy in nomadic area is lower than that observed in sedentary area (respectively 61,1% against 81,3%). One will note on the other hand at the level of food that 79,6% of the nomadic households have less than 2 meals per day for only 26,5% in sedentary area. These data partly explain the importance of the canteen in the improvement of the rates of schooling in nomadic area.

The weak rates of schooling are explained partly by the nomadic way of life of the populations in these localities. Indeed, before the intervention of the program, the only schools in the zone were those built by the State. The starting of the program coincided with the effectively of decentralization which truly started the creation of the Community schools. Thus, decentralization and the activities of the program created an unquestionable passion of the populations for the creation of the schools as it was the case in the commune of Intililt which knew the simultaneous creation of 4 new Community schools which very quickly become public.

Thus, faced with the identified obstacles to schooling , the relevance of the choice of the zone of intervention is proven. However, the geographical surface of intervention of the program is very vast as shown by the data below:

- from north to south, between Imisdounane and Tintihigrène : 600 km
- from North-West to south-east, between Tabankort and Tessit : 370 km

The distances between Gao and the farthest sites of the zone of intervention are presented as follows:

- Gao - Tintihigrène: 135 km
- Gao - Imisdounane: 460 km
- Gao - Tabankort: 390 km
- Gao - Tessit: 170 km

It is noted that there is between the four extreme sites of the zone of intervention an average distance of 485 km. What requires the deployment of rather significant resources, both at the human, material and financial levels. The large surface of intervention reduces the level of the results. Nevertheless, the need for consolidating the assets requires consolidating the activities on the same geographical surface with the risk of losing what was already made and which remains precarious.

*See diagram of the zone of intervention in appendix n°6.*

#### **4.2. Actors and relevance of the intervention through the NGOs**

The implementation of the program required the mobilization of actors hereafter: Local authorities, the Communities, Teachers, Civil society, decentralized technical services (AE, CAP),

The activities of the program were carried out on the field by three local NGOs, each one intervening in a definite zone.

Table n°3 : Personnel, zone of intervention by partner NGO

NGO	Creation	Date of start of the partnership with OGB	Zone and number of schools framed	Personnel recruited by the programme	
				Programme officer	Animatrices
ADESAH	2000	2001	Circle of Bourem 4 schools	1	4
GARI	1987	1990	Circle of Ménaka 9 schools	1	9
TASSAGHT	1985	1988	Circle of Gao 5 schools	1	5*
Total			18	3	18

Sources: Data collected from the education officers of partner NGOs

\* In the year 2007, a driver was recruited in order to drive the animatrice on the field taking into account her physical aspect.

It will be noted that the duration of the partnership with the local NGOs varies from a structure to another. It is 19 years for TASSAGHT, 17 years for GARI and 7 years for ADESAH. In the case of GARI and TASSAGHT, this partnership is older than the Education Program.

### **A short background of the experience of the partner NGOs in the field of education**

#### **- TASSAGHT:**

The activities of the NGOs as regards to education started with sessions of literacy and post-literacy since 1987 with the beginning of the fixing of the populations around the large ponds of the commune of Intililt. Indeed, having noted that the commune had the lowest rate of schooling of the region, Tassaght undertook a large public awareness campaign following which the populations engaged in the building of Community schools. Thus, the Community schools of Aza-bag-bag, Intahaca, Dorèye and Tintihigrène were created. For that reason, the populations were well organized in order to entirely take in charge the building of classrooms (generally in mud bricks), the wages of the teacher, and the food of the pupils.

#### **- GARI:**

The experience of this NGO started in 1987 with the organization of the populations of the site of Intadeyni for the creation of a Community school entirely financed by the populations. The school was run, during the first two years, without any external support. The cereals were provided by the populations and a unit of 15 goats was created to ensure the expenses of condiments.

#### **- ADESAH:**

This NGO practically began its experience as regards to education within the framework of the partnership with OGB.

It should be noted that the experience of TASSAGHT and GARI, as regards to the participation of the populations, are to be capitalized in the light of the sustainability of the actions of the program.

The knowledge of the area by the partner NGOs was of an unquestionable appropriateness for " the entry " of the program in the zone of intervention. It will still be the case for a better appropriation of the program by the populations.

As for the capacity of the partner NGOs to manage a program, it varies from one structure to another. GARI and TASSAGHT are much older than ADESAH and they have partners other than OGB with which they carried out other programs. However, an appreciation of the real capacity of these structures to carry out a program requires a thorough analysis of their organization, their operating mode, the real competence of human resources which they have as well as the quality of their management.

As for their capacity relating to the partnership with the program education, it will be essential to analyse more thoroughly the expertise acquired before coming to a conclusion about this question.

## **5. Degree of taking into account of the policies and educational trends**

The orientation Law promulgated on 28 December 1999 lays down the new policy of Mali regarding education and training. The PRODEC, which covers the period 1998-2008 and traces the broad outline of the implementation of this new policy, fixes the strategic choices amongst other things, around the following priority axes:

- An education of quality for all
- A use of the mother tongues in formal teaching in concomitance with French
- A policy of the textbook and operational didactic material
- A constant policy of training of the teachers
- A true partnership around the school
- An institutional reorganization and an adjustment necessary to the rebuilding of the education system
- A policy of communication centred on the dialogue and the consultation with all the partners
- A policy of financing of the education system taking into account all the aspects and possibilities of financing of the sector and falling under decentralization

The education program, object of this evaluation includes the axes/components hereafter:

- the access and retention
- quality
- gender equity
- advocacy

Moreover the support of the program to the schools through the activities undertaken (table n°2 above) integrates the in service training of teachers, the mobilization and the reinforcement of competences and capacities of the civil society around the questions of the school, etc.

Also, the program perfectly integrates the policies and educational trends of Mali. It remains that the frameworks of consultation envisaged by PISE are not yet effective. The inexistence of financial resources reserved for this purpose would be at the origin of this situation. So, to make effective these devices of consultation, it matters that the Education Authority, indicated

to ensure the permanent secretariat, works out, in collaboration with the other actors and the PTF, an action plan of the framework of consultation which could be submitted to the backers for request of financing.

## **6. Influence of education by the national strategies**

The national strategies which significantly influence the orientation of education are primarily Decentralization, the CSLP and the National Policy of fight against AIDS.

### **6.1. Decentralisation / deconcentration**

It was conceived to bring the administration closer to the populations and to make it possible to the maximum of citizens to have access to the basic social services such as health and education.

Also, the local government was made first persons in charge for the school in terms of planning and management, the orientation with regard to the programs of teaching always remaining under the responsibility of the central State.

During the passed decade, the civil society in Mali made a considerable move forward, from a point of view of the widening of its base as of the reinforcement of its competences and capacities. Thus, it plays an increasingly significant role in all the acts of the public life at the national, regional, local and more recently communal level. This importance of the civil society was recognized and devoted by the authorities in the new dynamics of good governance. Indeed, the decision-making integrating the civil society in the management of the businesses, such as for example the creation of CGS, constitutes major acts. However, this civil society still knows insufficiencies which limit its participation in the authorities in which it was integrated. These insufficiencies are:

- The low level of these officers for their capacities to fully assume competences which are reserved to them.
- The insufficiency of good governance in it
- The non-mastery of the mechanisms of financing and management of the school

The 10<sup>th</sup> objective of Prodec (PISE) is articulated around "a policy of communication centred on the dialogue and the rebuilding with all the partners ". Also, the devices of dialogue envisaged by PISE through the "practical Guide of the management of the school for the transfer of competences of the State to the Local Authorities" elaborated in September 2006, (*appendix n°9* and the "Handbook of procedures of implementation of PISE" of September 2001, are:

- The National Committee of consultation (CnaC)
- The regional Committees of consultation (CreC)
- The Circle Committees of consultation (CceC)
- The Communal Committees of consultation (CcoC).

These devices, taking into consideration their competence and their mission, constitute the right framework to operate the necessary connections and to establish the possible partnerships between the support to the process of decentralization and other reforms of the education system on one hand and special programs of local development on the other hand.

It remains that significant partners are to be integrated in the composition of these frameworks. These are among other things the National High Council of Fight Against AIDS (HCNLS). Moreover the SC is insufficiently represented, and the trade unions are rather defending the professional interests.

With the great number of the schools (especially Community), the request of teachers is by far higher than the offer. Such a situation is explained by the closing of some IFM, following the various Structural Adjustment Programs (SAP) that the country experienced in the Eighties.

Also, making available for the school the necessary services such as good quality teachers, their training, the management of the school environment, etc will take place only through:

- \* capacity building of the existing structures of training
- \* the widening and reinforcement of the basis of recruitment of the teachers by the creation of new structures of training
- \* reinforcement of competences of the organizations of support to the management of the school

## 6.2. The Strategic Framework of Fight Against Poverty (CSLP)

Generally, the CSLP is the breviary of all the policy of development of Mali. It fixes the axes of intervention and the overall objectives by branch of activity. Thus it is in education with Prodec.

## 6.3. The national policy of fight against AIDS

AIDS became a pandemic which negatively affects the efforts of development of any country and singularly the poor countries of which Mali. So, any strategy of development must integrate the fight against this plague in its approach and make a component of its activities of it. This is what explains the integration of the question of AIDS in the teaching syllabus and its taking into account by the program in its activities of sensitizing.

Other strategies not less significant also influence education. These are among other things the fight desertification with the schools of the Integrated Training Program in Environment (PFIE), etc.

## **B2. RESULTS**

### **1. Improvement of schooling**

The specific objectives of the program as regards to the improvement of the rates are:

- ✓ To increase at least by 70% the TBS (Gross Rate of Schooling) of the children in the region of Gao with at least 50% of girls in the zones of intervention before 2009
- ✓ To obtain at least 75 % of rate of survival of the pupils with 50 % of the girls until the 2nd Cycle before 2009

The data available enabled us to appreciate the evolution of the pupils enrolled during the second phase of the program as indicated in table n°5 below.

**Table n°4:** Evolution of the pupils enrolled during the second phase of the program

Ecoles	2003-2004	2004-2005	2005-2006	2006-2007	Total by school
--------	-----------	-----------	-----------	-----------	-----------------

	F	G	T	F	G	T	F	G	T	F	G	T	F	G	T
Taboye	198	255	453	221	280	501	221	279	500	241	271	512	881	1085	1966
Dengha	145	144	289	145	144	289	149	142	291	126	126	252	565	556	1121
Bia	129	161	290	129	161	290	132	144	276	149	146	295	539	612	1151
Baria	122	114	236	122	114	236	139	112	251	130	128	258	513	468	981
<b>Total Bourem</b>	<b>594</b>	<b>674</b>	<b>1268</b>	<b>617</b>	<b>699</b>	<b>1316</b>	<b>641</b>	<b>677</b>	<b>1318</b>	<b>646</b>	<b>671</b>	<b>1317</b>	<b>2498</b>	<b>2721</b>	<b>5219</b>
Doro	35	63	98	46	131	177	86	99	185	70	94	164	237	387	624
Doreye	23	33	56	20	35	55	32	30	62	44	28	72	119	126	245
Tintihigrene	44	46	90	56	49	105	72	57	129	77	75	152	249	227	476
N'Tahaca	46	52	98	68	64	132	95	94	189	98	105	203	307	315	622
Aza bag-bag	15	20	35	58	48	106	62	80	142	36	60	96	171	208	379
<b>Total Intiliit</b>	<b>163</b>	<b>214</b>	<b>377</b>	<b>248</b>	<b>327</b>	<b>575</b>	<b>347</b>	<b>360</b>	<b>707</b>	<b>325</b>	<b>362</b>	<b>687</b>	<b>1083</b>	<b>1263</b>	<b>2346</b>
Tabangout I	139	159	298	171	186	357	206	206	412	192	231	423	708	782	1490
Anouzagrène	107	145	252	37	66	103	59	122	181	45	71	116	248	404	652
Inagame	119	139	258	41	28	69	55	55	110	111	92	203	326	314	640
Intifrinkawene	134	127	261	78	96	174	74	66	140	135	100	235	421	389	810
Akabar	70	117	187	56	51	107	53	51	104	93	92	185	272	311	583
Imisdounane	90	95	185	40	35	75	99	115	214	59	69	128	288	314	602
Intadeyné	108	215	323	100	121	221	121	135	256	150	126	276	479	597	1076
Ikadewane	81	94	175	50	53	103	74	69	143	90	105	195	295	321	616
Ibalaghane	59	63	122	37	32	69	48	35	83	74	52	126	218	182	400
<b>Total Ménaka</b>	<b>907</b>	<b>1154</b>	<b>2061</b>	<b>610</b>	<b>668</b>	<b>1278</b>	<b>789</b>	<b>854</b>	<b>1643</b>	<b>949</b>	<b>938</b>	<b>1887</b>	<b>3255</b>	<b>3614</b>	<b>6869</b>
<b>Gen. Total</b>	<b>1664</b>	<b>2042</b>	<b>3706</b>	<b>1475</b>	<b>1694</b>	<b>3169</b>	<b>1777</b>	<b>1891</b>	<b>3668</b>	<b>1920</b>	<b>1971</b>	<b>3891</b>	<b>6836</b>	<b>7598</b>	<b>14434</b>

Sources : Education officers and activity Reports of partner NGOs

It will be noted that there are rather significant variations at the level of class sizes from year to year and between the various schools of the zone.

The determination of the variations makes it possible to better appreciate this variation.

## EVOLUTION OF THE SCHOOLING FROM YEAR TO YEAR DURING THE 2nd PHASE (2003-04 to 2006-07)

**Table n°5:** Rate of the differences between class sizes from year to year during the second phase

PARTNER /ZONE	NGO	2003-04 to 2004-05			2004-05 to 2005-06			2005-06 to 2006-07			2003-04 to 2006-07		
		F	G	T	F	G	T	F	G	T	F	G	T
ADESAH		3,87	3,71	3,79	3,89	-3,15	0,15	0,78	-0,89	-0,08	8,75	-0,45	3,86
GARI		-32,75	-42,11	-37,99	29,34	27,84	28,56	20,28	9,84	14,85	4,63	-18,72	-8,44
TASSAGHT		52,15	52,80	52,52	39,92	10,09	22,96	-6,34	0,56	-2,83	99,39	69,16	82,23
TOTAL		-11,36	-17,04	-14,49	20,47	11,63	15,75	8,05	4,23	6,08	15,38	-3,48	4,99

It arises from the table above that the evolution of class size was not of the same order in the zones framed by the NGOs. So, in the zone of GARI, class size evolved negatively during the first year of the second phase. This evolution would be due to the movements of the populations, the creation of new schools or the abandonment (final or temporary when the distribution of the food of WFP undergoes some delays).

One will note that the NGO TASSAGHT had the most significant variation, 52,52%, with 52,15% in the girls.

As a whole, class size increased by 4,99%.

**Graph n°1:** Variation rate of the numbers of girls.

**[Figure Removed]**

Class sizes increased considerably in the zone of Intililt during the first 3 years of the second phase. However, in the last year, the zone recorded a negative variation. This situation would be explained by the fact that the zone is strongly marked by the movements of the populations between Bourem and the Commune of Intililt. The period of data collection this last year coincided with the period of migration of the populations. However, the simultaneous reduction in class size in Bourem and in Intililt remains still unexplained.

At the level of Ménaka, class sizes evolved in the opposite direction of Intililt.

**Graph n°2:** Variation rate of the numbers of boys

**[Figure Removed]**

The evolution of class sizes for boys remains in the same as for girls in the three circles.

**Graph n°3 : Variation rate of class sizes from 2003 to 2007**

**[Figure Removed]**

To sum up, during all the second phase of the program, the average variation was negative for boys (-3,48%), while in the girls it was 15,38%, that is to say an evolution of 18,86% of the schooling of the girls compared to that of the boys. The negative variation for boys would be explained partly by the needs for valid arms in farm work. While in the girls the sensitizing carried out by the program involved a greater monitoring of the mothers about the schooling of their daughters. Table n°6 below corroborates this explanation because the girls are more present at school than the boys.

On average, class sizes increased by 4,99% during all the second phase of the program.

**Presence of the girls at school**

**Table n°6:** Presence of the girls in the schools of the program Year 2006-2007

ZONES	CLASS SIZE			% girls
	G	B	T	
Gao	347	360	707	49,08
Bourem	679	665	1344	50,52
Ménaka	949	938	1887	50,29
Total	1975	1963	3938	50,15

Source: Partners' reports

At the date of the mission of evaluation, the level of schooling (presence) of the girls is as indicated above in table n°6.

One will note that in the commune of Intililt, the rate of 50% fixed as objective of the program is not yet reached. The ceaseless movements of the populations between the circle of Bourem and the Commune would partly explain this situation. As a whole, there are more girls at the school than boys. These figures would better reflect the reality if they were accompanied by the gross rates of schooling which are unfortunately not available.

**To sum up, the program made it possible to have the results hereafter about the schooling of the children**

**Table n°7: Results obtained by NGO and by zone**

Partner NGOs	Zone of intervention.	N°. of schools framed	Total class sizes of pupils framed from 2001 to 2006		Increase of the enrolment rate		Retention		Increase of the success rate		% of women made literate	Amounts granted by women to the schools by zone
			Filles	Boys	Girls	Boys	Girls	Boys	Girls	Boys		
ADESAH	Bourem	4	4028	4897	55	48	98	86	25	23	108	1 279 950
GARI	Ménaka	9	ND	ND	ND	ND	ND	ND	ND	ND	75,49	none
TASSAGHT	Intililt	5	341	367	48,16	51,83	37,4	62,6	53		61,6	none
<b>Ensemble</b>		<b>18</b>	<b>4369</b>	<b>5264</b>	<b>34,39</b>	<b>33,28</b>	<b>67,7</b>	<b>74,3</b>	<b>26</b>	<b>25,33</b>	<b>96,75</b>	1 279 950

Source : Data collected from the education officers of partner NGOs

The absence of data for the Circle of Ménaka (GARI) does not make it possible to seriously come to a conclusion about the whole of the results above.

However, one will note that the increase in the rates of enrolment of the girls in the commune of Intililt is still lower than that of the boys (48,16 against 51,83). It is the same for the rate for retention for the girls which is 37,4% whereas that of the boys is 62,6%. These various rates are lower than those of the schools of the circle of Bourem. In this circle, the populations are mainly sedentary and it is noted that the rate of retention of the girls is higher than that of the boys.

The success rates are on the other hand higher in the schools of the commune of Intililt than in the schools of Bourem.

It is significant to note that in two years of activities of micro credit, the mothers of the schools of Bourem (only) could support the 4 schools with an amount of 1 279 950 FCFA for a subsidized capital of 6 002 000 FCFA.

## 2. Ratios of the quality of education

With the starting of the program, there were the ratios hereafter:

**Table n°8: A few ratios at the starting of the program**

Place	Ratio Pupils/Teachers	Ratio Pupils/class	Ratio book/pupils
Intililt	53	26,50	4,53
Ménaka	75,33	37,67	0,9
Bourem	76,67	38,33	3,34
TOTAL	72,71	36,36	2,9

Source: report of the study on the problem of basic education in the region of Gao, June 2001

Six (6) years after the start of the programme these ratios have evolved and are as follows:

**Tableau n°9 : Present level of ratios of the quality of education (school year 2006-2007)**

Place	Pupils/teacher	pupils/class	book/pupils	Course/Teachers
-------	----------------	--------------	-------------	-----------------

Intililt	50,27	25,13	1,7	2
Ménaka	51,97	32,72	0,68	1,59
Bourem	59,79	59,79	1,62	1
TOTAL	54,01	39,22	1,33	1,53

Source : Partners' reports

A comparison between these rates emphasizes the differences hereafter:

The number of pupils framed by teacher notably dropped. Moreover, the classes contain apparently less pupils than at the beginning of the program. However, the ratios pupils/Class hide much more alarming realities. Indeed, the sizes of some classes are much higher. It is the case in first year in Taboye (100), Intahaca (119) and Tabangout I (100). On the other hand in class 6, class sizes are generally smaller: Imisdounane: 2 pupils, Doro: 5 pupils. But, in Taboye there are 136 pupils in class 6.

In addition the fall of the ratios books/pupils is due primarily to the considerable increase in the number of pupils and not to the fall of the quantities of materials distributed. Indeed, at the beginning of the school year 2006-2007, 4, 593 books were distributed for a total class size of 3, 815 pupils.

### 3. Capacity Building

#### 3.1. At the level of the teachers and decentralized technical services of the state

Several activities of capacity building of the teachers and the technical services were undertaken. Thus training courses were organized on topics like:

- The Curriculum;
- The Communities of Learning of the Teachers (CA);
- Rights of the children and legislation of marriage;
- Development of action plans of the schools.

Moreover public awareness campaigns were carried out for the teachers on the issue of gender at school.

These various activities made it possible to improve the technical level of the teachers as well as the management of the gender approach at school.

It was noticed during the talks on the field that the school of Taboye is practically the only one (out of our sample of 9 schools visited) to implement the CA of teachers. This singular motivation of the teachers of Taboye seems to be related to the fact that they are all from the village, if not the commune. In this context, the issue of education takes a very different dimension.

#### 3.2. At the level of the structures of support and management of the school

##### - AME and Coordination

\* Activities of microphone-credit: To increase the incomes of the women for better supporting the schooling of the girls

The AGR are carried out only in the zone of Bourem, framed by the NGO ADESAH. In two years, the situation arises as follows:

**Table n°10:** Results of the activities of micro credit.

Places	Credit granted	Profit generated	Amount allocated to schools by women	% of the profit
Bourem	6. 002. 000	2 559 900	1 279 950	50
Total	6 002 000	2 559 900	1 279 950	50

Source : ADESAH reports

With a subsidy of 6, 002, 000 FCFA, the women managed to support the CGS with 1, 279, 950 FCFA, that is to say half of the profit generated which is 2, 559, 900 FCA. This profit accounts for 42.65% of the amount of the subsidy.

On average, each of the 4 schools benefited from a support of 320, 000 FCFA from the women. In this context of rural area, such a sum is very significant. Actually, the allocated amounts to each school varied according to the number of associations and adherent in the village. Thus for example, the school of Taboye could benefit from a support of 318, 000FCFA whereas the school of Dengha could be supported only up to 116, 375 FCFA.

Women express a certain pride when they evoke their contribution to the good operation of businesses of school, as the remarks of the president of the coordination of the women of Taboye attest it «When the CGS expresses a need for financing of an activity, we are the first to contribute, thanks to the incomes drawn from the micro credit ».

With such results, it is quite sure that the women will do better for the school if they are consequently supported.

However, there are limits to these activities. Indeed, nearly all the women undertake the same activities which are: small trade, market gardening, the small animal breeding, the manufacture of soap, etc. Even if they express the need for an increase in the financial volume of the support brought by OGB, such an increase would pose the problem of the flow of the productions which will become at the same time rather significant compared to the capacities for absorption at the local level.

**Photographs n° 4:** Discussion with a mother of pupils (in Taboye) who accommodates other children.  
**[Photos Removed]**

Literacy of women : Eliminate illiteracy in order to become autonomous

**Table n°11:** Number of women made literate

Places	Number of associations	Numbers	Number of Sessions taken	Numbers of members made literate	%
Bourem	15	850	6	920	108,23
Intililt	15	125	1	45 (5 members of AME by site)	61,6
Ménaka	ND	102	ND	77	75,49
<b>Total</b>	<b>30</b>	<b>1077</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>1042</b>	<b>96,75</b>

Source : Data collected from education officers of partner NGOs

The organization of women in coordination seemed a rational approach. The AGR which followed (Bourem) made it possible to accomplish these associations as well as the literacy of their members. But this activity of literacy remained limited both in the time and the point of view of the set of themes . Moreover, the trainings lacked a thorough follow-up. On average, coordination affirmed to have followed only 2 sessions of literacy.

The analysis of the table shows at the level of Bourem, that the numbers of women having followed the trainings are higher than the number of associations listed. This situation is explained by the fact that some women followed the trainings without belonging to the program. Indeed, these women are not members of the coordination installed. Their absence from the program is explained by religious consideration. Indeed, according to explanations of the Education programme officer of the NGO ADESAH (which frames the zone of Bourem), they consider that the system of micro credit is proscribed by the Islamic religion. It should however be announced that during the discussions with the women, especially in the zone of Bourem, crucial need to continue the trainings in literacy arose because the women (Dengha) affirmed not to be able to manage their activities with the number of trainings received (2 according to them).

Also, the figures of the level of women really made literate hide rather disparate realities between the three circles. In Ménaka for example, even if the figures are not available, discussions with the women revealed that the latter have a level much higher than in Bourem and Intililt.

- Support to the structures of management of schools (CGS)

The intervention of the program at the level of the School Management Committees dealt primarily with:

- the organization of training courses, with the following topics:
  - Institutional Organization of the school within the framework of the PRODEC
  - The School Management Committees: Composition/role
  - Administrative, financial and material management of a school
  - Communication
  - The schooling of girls: constraints and strategies for improvement
- the creation of school gardens,
- the equipment of the CGS in core of breeding by Food Sec
- the support to the host families,

➤ the support to the development of school plans

As a whole, the average number (2) and the topics of the trainings are insufficient. Indeed, insofar as decentralization places the school in the diary of the communities and the populations, it is then important to make them master all the essential levers to the promotion of education in their localities (mechanisms of financing, consultation and management framework of the school).

Table n°12: Situation of the pupils in the host families at the time of the evaluation

<b>Circles</b>	<b>Girls</b>	<b>Boys</b>	<b>Total Pupils hosted</b>	<b>Total Pupils School</b>	<b>Nb. Host Families</b>	<b>% Pupils Hosted</b>	<b>Nb. ratio. pupil./fam.</b>
Bourem	99	131	230	1294	169	17,77	1,36
Gao	102	90	192	754	83	25,46	2,31
Ménaka	257	315	572	1767	225	32,37	2,54
Total	458	536	994	3815	477	26,06	2,08

Sources: Reports and Education Officers of the NGOs

In the 18 schools of the program, the pupils hosted account for 26.06% of the class sizes of the school year 2006-2007.

Out of the total number of students hosted, there are 46.08% girls and 53.92% boys. There are on average 2 children hosted by family. However, the families in Ménaka individually host more children than in the two other circles: 2.54 against 2.31 in Gao and only 1.36 in Bourem.

This situation in Ménaka can be explained by two reasons: on the one hand, distances between the residences of the pupils and the school, and on the other hand, by the strong proportion of nomadic people in the population.

A disintegration of the host families in Women and Men would have enabled us to appreciate the degree of participation of the women in the reception of the pupils.

*See table of the situation of children hosted in appendix n°8.*

It is significant to announce that some schools were equipped with tables. As a whole 390 tables were distributed in 5 schools of the circles of Bourem (110), Gao (100) and Ménaka (180). The situation of these equipments appears in *appendix n°8*.

The school canteens are a determining factor, not only of the access but of the retention of the children at school. The first distributions of WFP aroused an interest in the parents who saw in this a free opportunity "to nourish their children". But that did not make it possible to cause the passion hoped for the school. Indeed, even if the data available do not enable us to support our remarks by figures, it arises from the discussions with the parents (especially mothers) that the intervention of OGB motivated much more the parents to let the children go to school especially when they know that the children will have 2 meals in the course of the day.

On the date of the mission of evaluation, the situation of the canteens in the schools framed by the Program is as follows:

In Bourem there are 1,294 pupils boarders of the canteen, 754 in Gao and 1767 in Ménaka.

Generally, all the pupils enrolled at school systematically benefit from the meals served at the canteen which are 2 meals per pupil and per day at the date of the mission of evaluation. In Doro on the other hand, OGB is the only intervener at the level of the canteen and the pupils have only one meal per day.

In order to reinforce the canteens, school gardens (vegetable gardens) were created. These gardens truly made it possible to improve the quality of the meals at the level of the schools. However, the activities at this level must begin at time in order to better benefit from it. It is to be noted that the process of creation of the school gardens is going on, which explains why some schools such as Doro do not have any yet. (It should be announced here that the creation of the school gardens is dependent on the availability of water on the site and in Doro, even the trees planted within the framework of the program are all desiccated, precisely for lack of water)

- OSC: Birth of the interregional coalition of the north

At the level of the OSC, the support of the program consisted in the capacity building for an effective advocacy.

Following the forum of Dakar, OGB undertook the implementation of the recommendations which rose from it with the organization of the World Weeks of Action which correspond with the last week of April of each year (SMA).

After the organization of 4 consecutive SMA, the OSC felt the need for capitalizing this experience, to extract the strengths and weaknesses found. Thus a workshop was organized in March 2006. This workshop had among other objectives to work out an action plan. It came out of this action plan, the installation of an interregional coalition which actually was born in December 2006.

The coalition installed has a provisional board composed of:

- Three focal points (Gao, Kidal and Timbuktu);
- A Chairwoman;
- Another member from Gao, which is the NGO ADESAH, ensuring the permanent secretariat.

Indeed, a coalition gathering the OSC of these three regions will have more presence not only at the regional, national level but also at the international level and will be able to carry out advocacy topics common to the three regions.

The general meeting of installation of the organs was to take place on July 15, 2007 but was deferred to a later date.

The action plan and the budget of the coalition must be amended and approved at the time of this general meeting.

The organization of the SMA made it possible to have as major results, the commitments by the authorities, the elected officials or officers of the decentralized technical services at the regional or local level. However, there is no follow-up of these commitments at the absence of a permanent framework. The creation of the coalition, which raised a great hope at the level of the OSC, will make it possible to fill these insufficiencies.

The challenges of education are still enormous and the coalition which has been just created already has topics for its activities of advocacy to come: Insufficiency of fundamentals in several schools of the region (classrooms, teachers, tables, benches), bad geographical distribution of the teachers, failure of the consultation institutions envisaged by PISE, etc. The effectiveness of the consultation institutions will constitute a strong opportunity for the coalition because it is within these frameworks of dialogue that it will be able to find and to establish alliances necessary for the reach of its objectives of advocacy and at the same time the aforementioned frameworks will constitute the ideal place of advocacy for the school.

To this end, it would be appropriate that it is supported in order to collect reliable data on education in the region and to prepare a consequent advocacy on the basis of the principle that an effective advocacy requires a clear and precise definition of the objectives to reach with an elaborate action plan in a participative way.

#### 4. Analyze of the impact of the program on the changes of attitude and practice of the populations of the zone of intervention

In term of impact of the program, it is necessary to note the notable evolution of the number of the schools in the zone of intervention which indicates changes of attitude of the parents concerning the schooling of their children. But, the existence of the committees of follow-up of school attendance of the AME is of an unquestionable influence on the attitude of these parents. Just as the permanent presence of the animatrices in the schools. The real impact of the program with regard to schooling could be appreciated only when the parents voluntarily send their children to the school, without any pressure and external support.

#### 5. Comparative analysis of the objectives and the results obtained

An analysis of the evolution of the rates compared with the objectives of the program gives the following results:

**Table n°13:** Objectives and results reached by the program

Wording	Objectives of the programme	Results obtained	Gaps
TBS	Increase at least by 70%% the TBS with at least 50% of girls before 2009	Data not available	Not determined
Literacy of women	75% of women framed by the programme will be made literate before 2009	96,75%	+21,75%
Rate of survival of the pupils	75 % with 50 % of girls until 2 <sup>nd</sup> Cycle before 2009	47,33%	- 31,67%
To influence the Malian Government to respect the commitments of Dakar concerning EFA.	Indicator not determined	- installation of the coalition of the north - Commitments by President ATT in 2005 in Gao	
To influence the implementation of policies favourable to the improvement of the quality of education in Mali before 2009	Indicator not determined		

#### Analysis of du table 13 :

The major objectives of the programme deal with the components access, quality, gender and advocacy. The results obtained with regard to the access to the school were largely exceeded. However, the retention of the children at the school still has problems dependent on several factors among other things:

- the incompatibility between the fixing of the school and the nomadic way of life of the populations;
- the distance from the residences of the pupils to the school,
- the fact that some parents are not yet convinced of the necessity of the schooling of the children, for religious

cultural and/or economic considerations.

## C PROGRAM APPROACH ANALYZE

Located at the basis of the interventions of OGB, the emergency is today combined with humanitarian and development actions. The first interventions of the program made it possible to answer the questions urgently dependent on school attendance of the children. Indeed, the diagnosis of the situation made it possible to emphasize aspects like the needs for food of the children, the needs for school stationery, the needs for care. This is what explains the support to the canteens, the equipment in school stationery, the installation of pharmaceutical kits to meet these emergencies.

It should however be recognized that the strategy of perpetuation of the actions was not integrated in the implementation of the program. This perpetuation can take place only through sustainable actions of development. Also, the perpetuation must be the axis of the interventions of the program in its next stage. This perpetuation must take into account at the same time the aspects :

- of making responsible of each actor and the setting in synergy of their actions
- capacity building of the communities to deal with the expenses of schooling of the children

Also, within the framework of the implementation of this integrated program approach, the programs Food Sec and Watsan (Food safety and water and Sanitation) particularly enabled the education program to carry out its activities during the last fiscal year 2006-2007 by their intervention at the level of the school canteens, the school gardens, the equipment of the schools in core of breeding, the distribution of material of pumping out and storage of water, the construction of latrines and water points.

This approach, based on the integration of the activities of the various programs not only makes it possible to minimize the costs of intervention, but in addition to save time. However, it will be necessary to see at differentiating the activities that can be integrated from those which simply require to be coordinated. Indeed, each program having its specificities, it is significant to take into account the accomplishment of the field activities with the risk of creating confusions if not incomprehension within the communities.

Table n°15 below indicates the possible level of integration of the activities of OGB/Gao

Table n° 15: Activities that can be integrated for the whole of the programs in the new approach

PROGRAMMES	ACTIVITIES RESERVED FOR EACH PROGRAMME	ACTIVITIES THAT CAN BE INTEGRATED
<b>EDUCATION PROGRAMME</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Equipping pupils with schools materials</li> <li>- Equipping schools with school furniture</li> <li>- prizes for the best girl pupils</li> <li>- In service training of teachers</li> <li>- Supplying books to teachers</li> <li>- support to the In service training of teachers</li> <li>- training of the structures in charge of school management</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Training the actors of the school</li> <li>- Animation /Sensitization in the schools</li> <li>- Feeding the pupils, (canteens)</li> <li>- First hand treatment to pupils (pharmaceutical kits)</li> <li>- Equipping host families with sheep and goats</li> <li>- Installation of a unit of support to the canteen (Restocking)</li> <li>- Support to women's AGR (micro credit), restocking,</li> <li>- Support to the SC for advocacy</li> <li>- Awareness on HIV/AIDS</li> <li>- planning, projects designing, support to micro credit</li> <li>- training of structures in charge of school management</li> </ul>

<b>FOOD SECURITY PROGRAMME</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>* Implement emergency answers in the zones of food insecurity in accordance with the local needs and the responding capacities of the market ;</li> <li>* Support the technical services during a vaccination campaign;</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>* Bring a technical support in management to 10 associations and /or GIE members</li> <li>* Support the reconstitution the herd of sheep and goats</li> <li>* Support the school canteens in food and organization in partnership with the education project</li> <li>* Develop and implement activities for advocacy and gender in each project</li> <li>* Develop and implement activities in order to train the staff of Oxfam – GB, and the partners of the community in each project</li> <li>* Develop a long term strategy and proposals of project for the Mali programme through the collaboration between the Bamako team and that of Gao</li> </ul>
<b>GENDER PROGRAMME</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Elaboration and implementation of a work plan for Gender Mainstreaming for the next year</li> <li>- Support to the celebration of special days (8 March, 31 July and, 1 December, etc): Dissemination of themes (international, national, regional) and the policy of Oxfam GB, Sensitizing and advocacy</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The training the Oxfam GB staff and partners</li> <li>- AGR in aid of women in pastoralist area</li> <li>- Recruitment of 1 animatrice for the integration of gender and its follow up</li> </ul>
<b>RURAL PASTORALISM PROGRAMME (PPR)</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- the building and the widening of the Network</li> <li>- The production of audio-visual documents of advocacy with the support of Dakar and Oxford in aid of the pastoralists.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- training sessions, exchange visits,</li> <li>- the realisation of infrastructures in order to improve the access to essential services on one hand and on the other hand encourage the organizational dynamic around economic and social topics while taking into account the gender aspect.</li> <li>- studies that can feed thinking and direct on ways of improving the conditions and livelihoods of pastoralists, consultation frameworks between the pastoralist organizations at the local, national and regional level, between the pastoralists organizations and the political decision makers and/or the African regional institutions.</li> <li>- Establishing relation with other actors</li> <li>- The coordination and technical and financial follow up of the programme</li> </ul>
<b>WATER SANITATION PROGRAMME</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Digging boreholes and the rehabilitation of existing water points</li> <li>- The training of menders for the boreholes</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>-The identification of villages with schools that have problems with supplying potable water</li> <li>-The training of members the water committees that will supervise the water points</li> <li>-The training for hygiene and the provision of hygiene kits to the schools</li> <li>-The training of teachers and school squads for hygiene</li> </ul>

		-The creation of school gardens -The training of the communities on health issues such as water related illnesses
--	--	--

Sources : Programmes OGB/Gao

In the current state of the practice, the integrated programme approach especially knows insufficiencies at the level of the coordination of the actions on the field. Indeed, the coordination of the missions on the field is insufficiently made, involving simultaneous displacements of teams in the same locality at the same period and sometimes to meet the same target groups.

The integration of the activities in the programme approach requires an overall planning. This overall planning will be able to take into account the new framework of dialogue which we propose in this report

## D. ASSET AND LESSONS OF the PROGRAM

### 1. Assets

The implementation of the program made it possible to have the assets hereafter:

- the mobilization of the communities around the question of education, in particular women
- the implication of these communities at the institutional level by the authorities in the management of the school (creation of the CGS and consultation institutions ) which results from the actions of the Civil Society with the support of the partners such as OGB.
- the creation of an inter-regional coalition for an effective advocacy
- regularity in the holding of the SMA

### 2. Lessons

The basic lessons of the program are:

- The Approach of entry through the model animatrices
- The intervention through the NGOs must be based on an effective knowledge of the area by those NGOs
- The quality of the work of the NGOs rests on the quality and competences of the human resources used for the implementation of the program
- The promotion of the schooling of the girls necessarily passes by a sensitizing of the mothers and a direct support to the communities (women through the micro credit)
- The success of a development program passes by the taking into account of the governing policies and the taking into account of the roles and responsibilities given to each actor by these policies.
- The accomplishment of the objectives of a program requires the setting at disposal of sufficient and qualified human resources.

## E – STRENGTHS AND WEAKNESSES OF THE PROGRAM

In spite of the efforts made, the implementation of the program knew strengths, but also weaknesses. Moreover, the program benefited from opportunities but some constraints limited its range. It seems convenient to us here to define our understanding of some of these terms.

- **Strengths of the program:** all the intrinsic causes, factors and/or circumstances of the program and which enabled and/or amplified the reach of the objectives.
- **Opportunities:** All the external circumstances and/or factors to the program but which reinforce or facilitate the reach of the objectives.
- **Weaknesses of the program:** all the intrinsic causes, factors and/or circumstances of the program and which influence the reach of the objectives negatively.

- **Constraints:** All the external circumstances and/or factors to the program and which limit the reach of the objectives.

The opportunities, as well as the constraints are external to the program; the strengths and weaknesses are intrinsic to it.

The strengths and weaknesses of the program by axis come out as follows in **table n°16** below:

**Table n° 16:** Strengths and weaknesses of the program

<b>AXES</b>	<b>STRENGTHS</b>	<b>WEAKNESSES</b>
<b>ACCESS AND RETENTION</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Existence of the model animatrices</li> <li>- Equipping the pupils with school materials</li> <li>- Feeding the pupils</li> <li>- First hand treatment of pupils</li> <li>- System of host families</li> <li>- Supplying water and pumping materials</li> <li>- Equipping the schools with school furniture</li> <li>- Giving prizes to the best girl pupils</li> <li>- Sensitizing the communities on girls schooling and early marriages</li> <li>- Integrating the programme at the level of the sites</li> <li>- support to the enrolment of girls</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Insufficiency in the number of human resources both at the level of OGB and at the level of partner NGO</li> <li>- Insufficiency of the sensitizing about the issues related to girls schooling</li> <li>- Lack of follow up of girls at the second cycle.</li> <li>- Wideness of the zone of intervention</li> <li>- Absence of follow up evaluation of the activities related to the access and the retention of pupils.</li> <li>- Inexistence of the logical framework of the programme</li> </ul>
<b>QUALITY</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- In service training of teachers,</li> <li>- Supplying didactic materials to teachers and pupils</li> <li>- Proven availability of the deconcentrated technical services</li> <li>- support to the implementation of the curriculum</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Non absolute commitment of the decentralized technical services in the planning, the implementation and the follow up evaluation of the activities related to the improvement of the quality of education</li> <li>- Inexistence of the logical framework of the programme</li> <li>- Insufficiency in the follow up evaluation of the activities on the quality of education</li> </ul>
<b>EQUITY/GENDER</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Presence of the model Animatrice</li> <li>- Support to the enrolment of girls</li> <li>- Literacy of women</li> <li>- Support to women AGR</li> <li>- Prizes for the best girl pupils</li> <li>- Taking into account gender in the building of latrines</li> <li>- Sensitizing the families and the teachers on integrating gender in the framing plans of the pupils at school as well as in the family</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Inexistence of the logical framework of the programme</li> <li>- Insufficiency in the follow up evaluation of the activities in equity : gender</li> </ul>
<b>CAPACITY BUILDING</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- training the organizations of support to the management of the school</li> <li>- Support to women AGRs (micro credit), to CGS</li> <li>- Support to the constitution of a core for breeding</li> <li>- information and sensitizing of the communities</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Insufficiency of training both concerning the topics and the number of sessions</li> <li>- Insufficiency in the number of literacy sessions (basic alpha and post-alpha)</li> <li>- Low level of financial support to women AGRs</li> <li>- Inexistence of the logical framework of the programme</li> <li>- absence follow up evaluation of the activities of capacity building</li> </ul>

<b>ADVOCACY</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Prise de conscience de la SC</li> <li>- Connaissance de la question de l'éducation au niveau de la région par les OSC</li> <li>- Adhésion des OSC aux objectifs de l'EPT</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Inexistence of the logical framework of the programme</li> <li>- absence follow up evaluation of the activities of advocacy</li> </ul>
<b>PARTNERSHIP</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Connaissance du milieu par les NGO partenaires</li> <li>- Expérience en matière d'éducation des NGO</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Insufficiency of dialogue between OGB and the partner NGOs</li> <li>- Non commitment of some key actors such as the decentralized communities</li> <li>- Poor organizational and institutional capacity of some actors such as the CGSs the AMEs, and the coalition</li> <li>- the insufficiency of human resources at the level of partners</li> <li>- Insufficiency of the clarification of the role and responsibilities of each actor of the programme.</li> <li>- Absence of synergy between the different actors</li> <li>- Inexistence of the logical framework of the programme</li> <li>- absence of follow up evaluation in the activities of partnership</li> </ul>

Beyond these strengths and weakness, the program benefited from some assets or opportunities such as:

- the partial fixing of the nomadic communities
- the creation of new schools

Beyond the intrinsic weaknesses of the program, some constraints negatively influenced the results obtained. To this end, one can quote among other things:

### 1. At the level of the schools

- the insufficiency of fundamentals (classrooms, teachers, tables benches) in some schools of the program: these fundamentals are the classrooms, the tables and the teachers
- the defective condition of some classrooms: collapsing roofs, lack of windows. This defective condition involves the disaffection of these rooms and reduces at the same time the capacities of reception of the schools. These classrooms are entered as functional whereas they do not accommodate pupils because the teachers refuse to take the risk to teach in them. Whenever the teachers do not have other solutions to remain there, the state of these classes constitutes a real permanent danger for the teacher and the pupils.
- the uneven distribution of the teachers between the schools of the region. Indeed, the ratio course/teacher is very frequently higher than 1 in some schools of the region, in particular in the urban district of Gao. This situation is explained by the fact that some teachers, who were however recruited to serve in the rural schools, refuse to join these schools and prefer to remain in Gao.
- inexistence of kitchens and refectories: the meals are cooked at the open air and the pupils also eat there. That is incompatible with the training activities in hygiene, carried out by OGB.

### 2. At the Community level

- Insufficiency of governance within the OSC: meetings not held regularly, no renewal of the leading bodies, low level of the contributions, etc
- non mastery of the texts on the management of the school in decentralized mode

- the low level of the members of the organizations of support to the management of the school
- the abstract statute of the HEART which does not enable them to be institutional partners as well as the other actors
- Low level of the animatrices
- Low capacity of the mothers to support the schooling of the girls
- Prevalence of the men within the CGS

### **3. At the level of the partners**

- non mastery of the new policies of education by the agents of the NGOs
- the low level of human resources for the implementation of the program
- Insufficiency in collaboration with the engineering departments, the local authorities
- youth of the interregional coalition of the north
- lack of regular meetings between the members of the coalition
- Non functionality of the institutions of consultation (ST, CT, NGO)
- youth of the interregional coalition of the north

### **4. At the level of OGB**

- document management

At the level of the documentation of the program, it is to be noted the weaknesses hereafter:

- Multiplicity of the reports to produce (sometimes with same information and the same periods)
- multiplicity of the formats of reporting according to the nature of the funds
- Inexistence of a system of follow-up evaluation (with indicators, tools for collection, precise periods of collection, roles / precise responsibilities)
- Insufficiency in the system of filing of the physical reports at the level of the administration and the program

## **F – PROPOSAL FOR NEW STRATEGIC ORIENTATIONS OF THE PROGRAM**

All the future actions of the education programme must fall under a logic of perpetuation. This logic of perpetuation supposes on the one hand, that each actor fully plays his roles and responsibilities and on the other hand, that the communities have the capacity to challenge the failing actors such as the State and the decentralized communities.

Also, we propose the strategic orientations below which are at 4 levels primarily:

- the Advocacy
- the support to the school and to the basic communities
- the setting in synergy of the actors (management of the partnership)
- the support to the decentralized technical services of the State

## **1. SUPPORT TO ADVOCACY**

At this level, the strategic orientation of the program will be able to relate to two points:

### **1.1. Capacity building of the OSC and the actors of the program**

This capacity building will relate to:

a) the information and the sensitizing of the actors of the Civil Society: Translation into the local language and popularization of the texts governing the management of the school in decentralized mode

This stage is determining in the reach of the objectives of the program and for the perpetuation of the assets.

Indeed, from this evaluation, it appears clearly that the perpetuation of the assets is one of the major concerns at all the levels of intervention of the program. It is thus essential to bring each actor, to some level that enables him/her, to play its role fully and to assume its responsibilities.

It is to be noted that the process of decentralization which started since more than one decade required the adoption of a whole set of texts and taking some measures in order to ensure full and entire participation of each actor to the management of the school in this new context of decentralization. It is amongst other things of the PRODEC, the law of orientation on Education, about the practical guide of management of the school, the specifications of transfer of competences, the strategic plan of training of the teacher of Mali, etc. These various texts badly known or are simply ignored actors of the Civil Society. Thus, they becomes at the same time badly armed to play their roles fully.

From where need sufficiently for equipping them by putting to their provision the unit of the texts which govern the management of the school in decentralized mode.

### **b) training of the organizations of the Civil Society**

One of the weaknesses of the program, at the same time as it was a constraint, is the low capacity of the organizations of the Civil Society to carry out advocacy and public awareness campaigns. This situation is due to their low level and to the limitation if not to the inexistence of human and financial resources. So, we propose the organization of training courses centred on the topics hereafter:

- techniques of sensitizing and advocacy
- techniques of funds raising
- management and governance within the OSC
- follow-up evaluation of the activities
- development of a management report

These last two topics will be addressed to the actors specifically intervening directly in the implementation of the activities of the program.

### **1.2. The support to the implementation of the action plans of the Civil Society**

It is about a support to the coalition for the execution of elaborate action plans in a participative way with all of its components. Indeed, taking into account the current level of the governance within the OSC, this support could be done in two stages:

- Support to the development of the participative action plan of the coalition
- Support to the implementation of the action plan of the coalition

## **2. DIRECT SUPPORT TO THE SCHOOLS AND THE GRASSROOTS COMMUNITIES**

The elements of support proposed below are only indicative. Generally, the support to the schools and the communities must be done on the basis:

- of a participative diagnosis

- of an elaborate action plan in a participative way

Also, while waiting for the results of such an exercise, the support of OGB can intervene at the levels hereafter:

### 2.1. The direct support to the schools

This support will be articulated around these objectives:

#### a) Improvement of the access and the retention

Here, the strategies applied at the time of the two preceding phases showed their effectiveness except that the approach calls for thinking as to the perpetuation. These strategies can be renewed with however a reserve with regard to the support brought to the host families. Indeed, if an overall strategy is adopted to increase the resources of the communities and to fight against poverty, it will not be necessary any more to bring a specific support to the host families.

This overall strategy will consist to choose an improvement of the incomes of the communities. To this end for example, it could be retained the generalization of the AGR to men and their extension to the whole of the zone of the program.

Moreover, OGB could study the possibility of a support to the increase of the reception capacities in the schools, among other things through the actions hereafter:

- a support to the construction of classrooms and/or to the improvement of the living conditions of teachers (construction of residences for teachers for example, etc),
- a support in school furniture
- a support to the recruitment of teachers. Accordingly, the technical skills of some animatrices who already have an acceptable level could be reinforced between them and to support them so that they can integrate the body of the teachers at the level of their respective village (an advocacy near the services of recruitment could be carried out for this end)

However, it is to be noted that these proposals will have to belong to an action plan worked out from the above-mentioned participative diagnosis with the communities

In addition, in the schools where OGB is alone to intervene at the level of the canteen, it is necessary to study the possibility of increasing the quantities so that the children can have the 2 meals per day as in the other schools of the program. Such a support of OGB must be based on a clear and precise determination of the contributions of each actor concerned: Local communities, Authorities, Decentralized technical services. All future intervention must henceforth take into account the aspect of the participation of the communities.

#### b) Improvement of the quality of education

The new strategic orientation of the program as regards to the improvement of the quality of education will take place through:

- a support to the in service training of teachers. This support will have to take into account the intervention of the other actors such as the State, the decentralized communities, other technical and financial partners, etc
- campaigns of information and sensitizing on hygiene and sanitation in educational circle as well as at the level of the home environment.
- a support to the access to the school stationery and didactic material for the teachers, etc

#### c) Improvement of the balance between girls and boys

- Support to the recruitment of the girls by the sensitizing of the parents so that they bring the children to the school
- Prize for the best pupils girls

## 2.2. Capacity building of the organizations of support to the management of the school

### a) Reinforcement of competences of the organizations of support to the management of the school

This strategic axis could be done by:

- information and sensitizing on:

texts governing the management of the school in a decentralized mode as indicated in the strategic axis of support to the advocacy. During the popularization of these texts, a particular stress will have to be put on the following aspects:

- right and duties of each actor
- mechanisms of financing and management of finances of the school
- responsibilities for each actor in the financing of the school

Religion and role and place of the girl/woman in the community

hygiene and the sanitation in the family

STI and the HIV/AIDS

- the realization of training courses on the topics hereafter:

- . Elimination of illiteracy (basic and post-alpha)
- . Management and governance within associations

Female leadership (this training addresses only to coordination of women, with the AME, as with the organizations of women members of the coalition)

### b) The support to the improvement of the level of incomes of the grassroots communities

This approach has an overall aim of fight against the poverty, which is at the basis of the delays of schooling in the area and singularly in the zone of intervention of the program.

So, in a global solution of improvement of the capacities of the communities to take in charge the expenses of schooling as well as fight against poverty, it would be more judicious:

- to generalize this support to the men and the women
- to increase the level of the support to the AGR
- to extend it to the whole of the zone of intervention of the program.

This approach implies a reorganization of the grassroots communities, especially the men, the women being already structured in coordination.

Within the framework of the specific management of the school, the equipment of the CGS in core of breeding as well as the activities of market gardening could be renewed.

## 3. SUPPORT TO THE DECENTRALIZED STATE TECHNICAL SERVICES

At the level of this axis also, meetings of clarification with the decentralized technical services are necessary, even essential. These meetings will enable:

- to identify the possible levels of support
- methods of the support

This axis of intervention comprises:

- a support to ongoing training of the teachers and of which the levels and methods could be given at the time of the above-mentioned meetings
- a support to the technical follow-up-evaluation of the quality of education according to the national policies and objectives' of the program. Indeed, within the framework of the component quality of the program, it is significant that OGB can follow the quality of education, at least in its zone of intervention.

Accordingly, its support to the follow-up could direct towards the dissemination of information (given) from the technical services.

#### **4. The MANAGEMENT OF THE PARTNERSHIP**

It is to be noted that the partnership is understood here as the interactive relation between the various actors of the program. The partnership is thus multilateral. The major question is to know how to operate the synergy of action between the various actors of the program? To this end, the need for creating a framework of intervention is essential. This framework of intervention will enable:

- to imply all the actors by a clear determination of their roles and responsibilities
- to have a situational participative diagnosis of problems related to the management of the school
- to share information
- to share the same vision as for the objectives and the strategies of the program
- to organize and harmonize the actions on the field
- to work out a participative plan of follow-up-evaluation of the activities
- to share and capitalize the experience of each actor in order to better document the program. During the meetings of the framework, each actor will have to share with the others his experiences in the implementation of the activities. All the experiences could thus be sufficiently documented and capitalized for the documentation of the program.

Decentralization having made the town halls the first responsible for the school at the communal level, those could be retained as pillar of this new framework of intervention which could be structured as follows:

To sum up, the new framework of intervention that we propose is as follows:

**[Figure Removed]**

**Tableau n°17 : Explication du schéma du cadre d'intervention**

**N.B**

<b>STRUCTURES</b>	<b>RELATIONS IN THE FRAMEWORK</b>	<b>ROLES &amp; RESPONSIBILITIES</b>	<b>NEEDS IN CAPACITY BUILDING</b>
OGB	Technical and Financial Partner	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- designing the programme</li> <li>- technical and financial support</li> <li>- follow up/evaluation</li> </ul>	- Training in follow up/Evaluation of the field activities
Coordination	Adviser	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- orientation/arbitration/validation</li> <li>- planning</li> <li>- follow up/evaluation</li> <li>- Sharing information and exchange of experiences</li> </ul>	-
Decentralized Communities (CD)	Partner	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- taking in charge the school</li> <li>- coordination</li> <li>- follow up/evaluation</li> </ul>	- Training on the texts regulating the management of school in a decentralized mode
Organizations of support to the management of school	Partner	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- advocacy</li> <li>- implementation of the activities</li> <li>- follow up/evaluation</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Training on the texts regulating the management of school in a decentralized mode</li> <li>- support (material and financial) to capacity building of the communities for taking in charge the schooling fees of the children</li> </ul>
SDE	Partners	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- technical support</li> <li>- participation to the taking in charge</li> <li>- follow up/evaluation</li> </ul>	- Support to building operational capacity
Schools	Partners	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- implementation of the activities</li> <li>- follow up/evaluation</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Training on the texts regulating the management of school in a decentralized mode</li> <li>- support (material and financial) to capacity building of the communities for taking in charge the schooling fees of the children</li> </ul>

The coordination joins together all the actors of the education programme.

The texts regulating the operation of this coordination will have to be worked out and adopted in the spirit and the letter of the texts governing the management of the school in a decentralized mode in Mali.

The level of implementation of the framework will be in accordance with the objectives: Region, Circle or Commune.

The effective roles and responsibilities for each actor will be definitively given only after the various participative diagnoses mentioned above.

The support to the management of the partnership will happen at the levels hereafter:

- a) Support to the creation of the framework of intervention: composition, determination of the organization and operation
- b) Support to the development of the action plan of the framework
- c) Support to the implementation of the action plan of the framework

## **G - RECOMMENDATIONS**

The weaknesses and constraints noted at the level of the program and the new strategic orientations suggested imply the readjustments hereafter:

### **1. At the institutional level**

- the creation of a unit of follow-up-evaluation which will be able to intervene in a transverse way on the unit of the programs of OGB/Gao
- reinforcement of the current team of follow-up of the field activities through the recruitment of new agents and the training of all the agents in follow-up-evaluation of the field activities
- Building the operational capacities (in human resources) of the present education team within the framework of the implementation of the recommendations and singularly of the new framework of intervention which we propose. Indeed, the implementation of the framework of intervention requires time, resources for the organization of the meetings, the production, the multiplication and the dissemination of the documents, as well as the follow-up of the recommendations. Moreover, the activities of the implementation will be held at the same time of the other activities of the program on the field (programming, preparation of the new school year, etc), which will take sufficient time to the two agents of the program (PO and his/her Assistant). Hence the need for the reinforcement of the team in the implementation of the recommendations.
- the capitalization of the experiences of the agents before their departure. Indeed, each agent will be led to work out, before its departure, a report on its experience at OGB. This report could be articulated around the following points: Sociological analysis of the area of intervention, activities and strategies of implementation, assets and lessons, forces, weaknesses and errors strategic, recommendations.
- improvement of the management of logistics. At the time of the evaluation, we noted as logistics as well has problems of management at the level of the planning as of the coordination of the missions of ground. The missions seem to intervene in an unforeseen way and in the urgency.

### **2. At the level of the management of the activities of the program**

- making a logical framework of the program
- training the agents of OGB and the partners in follow-up-evaluation
- making effective tools for follow-up-evaluation
- development of a participative action plan of follow-up-evaluation
- development of a canvas of drafting of the management reports, valid for all the partners
- the sufficient documentation of the activity reports
- improvement of the document management. The program, as well as the other programs of OGB/Gao, knows insufficiencies of the document management. Indeed, the program is not only insufficiently documented, but in addition, the existing documentation is scattered at two levels: administration and the P.O. Failing to have a service of documentation, all the documents relating to the program must be consulted in only one place (either at the level of the administration, or at the level of the program).

The strategy of perpetuation of the actions of the program will have to be based on two essential axes:

- capacity building of the communities to deal with the expenses of schooling of the children and the management of the school and to make an advocacy in favour of the taking into account of their specific needs.
- 
- reinforcement of the competences of the local authorities and the civil society to carry out an effective advocacy and to require that each actor of the school fully plays his role.

Thus, a particular stress will have to be put on these two axes which are contained in the proposals made at the point G above.

**Photo n°5**

**Photo n°6**

**[Photos Removed]**

---

**Photos of the workshop of restitution of the results of the evaluation of the programme**

**[Photos Removed]**

---

**Photo n°7**

**Photo n°8**

The workshop of restitution joined together all the actors of the program: OGB, Police headquarters, Decentralized Communities, Coalition, CGS, AME, services providing NGOs, Academy, CAP, Teachers, regional Assembly .

## **H - ASSUMPTIONS AND RISKS**

### **1. Assumptions**

- Acceptance of the approach by all the actors
- Commitment of each group of actors to assume its roles and responsibilities
- Availability of the resources (human, financial and material at all the levels)
- Respect of the planning

### **2. Risks**

The risks are related primarily to the answers brought to the assumptions above.

Particularly, the perpetuation of the actions of the program is dependent on the mastery of the various texts governing the management of the school in decentralized mode. So, the major risks are:

- the availability of the resources
- acceptance by each actor to fully play his roles and responsibilities in the new stage for the program

Moreover, another risk, not related intrinsically to the program, is the security issue in the zone of intervention. This security issue relates to the physical safety as well as the food safety dependent on the state of the rainfall and which could divert the efforts of the communities.

## I OPERATING MODE

In a practical way, we propose the following methodological diagram:

**STAGE I** Distribution to the actors of the documents hereafter:

- evaluation report
- report of the workshop of restitution
- terms of reference of the workshop on the stakes holders

**STAGE II** Organization of the above-mentioned workshop

**STAGE III** Elaboration of the document of the next phase of the program

**STAGE IV** Organization of the new school year

**N.B.** The implementation of the procedure proposed above supposes as a preliminary the definition of the assumptions (bases/orientations) of work by the staff of OGB. These definitions of the assumptions must intervene the sooner in order to make it possible to take necessary action to the formulation of the next phase of the program and to prepare the new school year which is coming. These working hypotheses are:

**\* validation of this report**

**\* the indication of the option chosen for the management of the partnership with the NGOs:**

will the program renew the partnership with the NGO?

If so, what will be the new orientations of this partnership? The choice to renew the partnership with the NGOs will require one, if not, several meetings of clarification between OGB and those NGOs.

If not, what will be the new approach of management of the partnership? (in the context of the new framework of intervention).

**\* determination of the zone of intervention:** Keeping, reduction or extension of the current zone.

## **CONCLUSIONS**

The Education program, implemented since May 2001 and which covers 18 schools in the communes of the circles of Bourem, Gao and Ménaka recorded notable results as regards to the improvement of the schooling and the awakening of the populations about the school issue.

The of pupils enrolled indeed underwent an explosion and the populations, in particular the women, mobilize themselves more and more to perfect the education of the children.

These results are the resultant of the efforts done primarily by OGB to raise the level of schooling which was the weakest of the region, if not the country. These efforts relate to the reinforcement of competences of the actors, the direct support to the schools and the communities and advocacy.

However, some factors still exist which threaten the results obtained if actions of consolidation are not undertaken at the level of the actors. These actions must relate to various axes which relate to the capacity building and competences of the communities, of the Organizations of support to the school, of the Civil society and the decentralized state technical services. The actions to come must allow a progressive taking in charge of the school by the communities and the decentralized state technical services.

---

## **LIST OF APPENDICES TO THE REPORT**

---

1. TOR
2. Technical Proposal
3. List of des documents consulted and evaluation tools
4. Chronogram
5. Sample and list of the schools of the programme
6. Plan of the zone of intervention of the programme
7. List of people we met
8. Tables: Situation of children hosted, situation of the equipment in school furniture of the schools of the programme
9. TOR: practical Guide of management of the school, TOR: transfer of competences and Note on the consultation frameworks of the AE
10. Some images taken during the mission

© Oxfam GB 2007

First published online by Oxfam GB in 2010.

This document is part of a collection of programme evaluations available from Oxfam GB in accordance with its evaluation policy.

This document was originally written for internal accountability and learning purposes, rather than for external publication. The information included was correct to the evaluator's best knowledge at the date the evaluation took place. The views expressed in this report are those of the author(s) and do not necessarily reflect Oxfam's views.

The text may be used free of charge for the purposes of advocacy, campaigning, education, and research, provided that the source is acknowledged in full. The copyright holder requests that all such use be registered with them for impact assessment purposes. For copying in any other circumstances, or for reuse in other publications, or for translation or adaptation, permission must be secured and a fee may be charged. Email [publish@oxfam.org.uk](mailto:publish@oxfam.org.uk)

For further information on the issues raised in this document email [phd@oxfam.org.uk](mailto:phd@oxfam.org.uk)

Oxfam is a registered charity in England and Wales (no 202918) and Scotland (SC 039042). Oxfam GB is a member of Oxfam International.

**[www.oxfam.org.uk](http://www.oxfam.org.uk)**